# HardGospel

Love God • Love your neighbour

## What *difference* did it make?

*An independent evaluation of The Hard Gospel Project*

*Tony Macaulay is an independent
development consultant
www.macaulayassociates.co.uk*

# Foreword

*By The Archbishop of Armagh*

The three years since the Hard Gospel Project swung into action have seen important project initiatives that have changed significantly the awareness of and attitude towards issues of difference within the Church of Ireland. The evaluation conducted by Macaulay Associates offers much encouragement but it also clearly indentifies areas that can only, at best, be regarded as 'work in progress'. The challenge to the Church of Ireland, now that the professionally facilitated phase of the task has ended, is first, to sustain the momentum of commitment to change, and second, to internalise the lessons learned from the project so that they become systemically incorporated in the life stream of the Church. There must be sustained, transformed new life after the Hard Gospel Project.

It is tempting but too easy to pass this task to an 'Implementation Group' to ensure appropriate outcomes. That Group will need the total commitment of all the active members of the Church of Ireland if the end we seek under God is to be achieved. We should note with humility the comment on page 20, section 5.2 that 'The size, nature and culture of the Church of Ireland as an institution results in a slow pace of organisational change'. If other objectives are to be achieved, the issue of a culture of slow organisational change will have to be addressed: everyone remarks upon it, very many fewer have an appetite to address it. This, the final evaluation report of a flagship project of the Church of Ireland, deserves and requires sustained attention.

+Alan

*The Most Reverend Alan Harper*
*Archbishop of Armagh*

*April 2009*

# Contents

# Executive Summary

1. The Hard Gospel Project initiated, developed, supported and co-ordinated a wide range of activities involving more than 7,500 people across every diocese in Ireland between November 2005 and December 2008. This is the most substantial denominational church initiative of its kind to have taken place in Ireland.

2. The Church of Ireland demonstrated its commitment to the development and implementation of the Hard Gospel Project through the level of time and resources invested in ensuring it made a difference. The project was managed effectively through the Hard Gospel Committee and a high level of activity was stimulated and delivered by the small project staff team.

3. A major achievement was to raise awareness of the project and the issues it was spotlighting at all levels of the Church of Ireland. The project provided a range of opportunities at all levels to address issues of difference, community conflict and sectarianism. Discussion of 'Hard Gospel issues' has become normative within the Church of Ireland. The issues and approaches of the Hard Gospel are becoming mainstreamed into the Church and there has been a degree of culture change towards more open discussion of diversity issues. This enabled the Church to take a series of new initiatives and some of these had an impact in the wider community.

4. The project enhanced the overall capability of the Church of Ireland to take initiatives to build peace and transform communities by providing training and support at parish and diocesan levels and by supporting the development of a series of diocesan and parish level initiatives. The outcome is new initiatives by churches actively contributing to community development and peacebuilding, including youth initiatives, in a breadth of locations and levels.

5. The project developed a series of high quality resources and disseminated these throughout the Church and beyond.

6. The project developed demonstration projects that addressed key strategic issues in relation to the legacy of conflict and an increasingly multi cultural Ireland. The projects on immigration and loyalist communities were at the 'cutting edge' of contemporary diversity and inclusion issues in Ireland during the past three years.

They engaged the Church of Ireland in these issues at a level and depth that had previously not been possible. The projects were well designed and delivered by the project staff team and they attracted the attention of wider society. They have been written up and disseminated as models of good practice for the wider church and society.

7.  The pace of organisational change as a result of the project has been slow. It has taken three years for the beginnings of change in structures, policies and practices to become apparent. In spite of substantial time and resources being invested in research, discussion, committees and publications, this has produced limited change to date. Success can only be measured in terms of any change that actually takes place in the future.

8.  The project faced challenges including the scale of the task, different expectations, barriers to change within the 'culture' of the Church and the danger of being reduced to the status of a marginal short-term project.

9.  A major challenge was to both stimulate and support activities to demonstrate new approaches and build capacity while at the same time influence organisational culture, policies, practices and structures so that the Hard Gospel would become a mainstream and embedded long-term process within the Church.

10. The project achieved a wider community profile through good media coverage of its activities, as a result of a well-implemented communications strategy. This was most successful when the project highlighted issues that were then taken up and developed into wider public discussions through the media.

11. The project was successful in developing a series of new collaborations and partnerships with other churches, organisations and agencies on relevant issues and initiatives. The project staff successfully implemented a series of initiatives with other churches, agencies and groups with a clear focus on creating more open and inclusive local communities.

12. The plans developed for the post-project phase of the Hard Gospel process have a strong focus on mainstreaming the process at a central level, while at the same time identifying ways of supporting sustained interventions at diocesan and parish levels.

13. The evaluation has one major recommendation that the Church of Ireland should put in place the necessary structures, strategies and resources to continue its Hard Gospel process as a long-term mainstream initiative within the Church that will create both internal change and practical action in local communities on diversity issues.

# 1  Introduction

What difference did the Hard Gospel Project make over the past three years?

This report aims to answer this question.

It is the independent evaluation report of the Church of Ireland's Hard Gospel Project (HGP) for the period 1st November 2005 - 31st December 2008.

Following the appointment of an independent external evaluator, Macaulay Associates, an evaluation framework and methodology were established during the first year and carried out throughout the three years of the project.[1] This included internal annual evaluation reports for the first two years that included recommendations for continuously improving and learning from the project.

This final report sums up the findings of three years of evaluation[2] and is aimed at a wider audience, so that the learning and experience of the Hard Gospel Project can be shared with others.

The report includes:

- An executive summary of the main findings and recommendations
- A summary of project activities
- A discussion of the learning from the main achievements and challenges of the project
- An assessment of the impact of the project against its intended objectives
- A recommendation for the future

[1] The evaluation framework and methodology are in Appendix I.
[2] Where quotes from previous evaluation reports are used the year is noted.

# 2  Background to the Hard Gospel Project

## 2.1  The Development of the Hard Gospel Project

In 1997 the General Synod of the Church of Ireland adopted a motion that the Church was opposed to sectarianism. It started a process of self-examination with the intention of determining how *'to promote, at all levels of church life tolerance, dialogue, co-operation and mutual respect between the churches and in society.'*

A Church of Ireland Sectarianism Working Party was established and this led to the setting up of the Sectarianism Education Project in 2001. The aim of this initiative was to assist parishes throughout the island of Ireland to increase their capacity for dealing with sectarianism and difference and explore how dealing positively with these issues would have an impact on decision-making within the Church.

This project commissioned a research project to ascertain the attitudes, needs and experiences of clergy and lay people throughout the Church of Ireland on these issues. The outcome of the research was a Scoping Study Report entitled *'The Hard Gospel: Dealing Positively with Difference in the Church of Ireland'*. This report was presented to and received by the General Synod in 2003.

As a result of the findings of the research the remit of the Sectarianism Education Project was widened to consider how to deal with difference in a range of areas including minority ethnic groups, people of other religions and issues of sexuality and gender while retaining a major emphasis on sectarianism. The expanded initiative was named 'The Hard Gospel' and a Hard Gospel Committee was convened to oversee the development of the project.

The Scoping Study has been described as *'possibly the most comprehensive piece of research ever attempted in one Christian denomination/church in Ireland, and has involved people at all levels of the church.'*

The Scoping Study Report, *'The Hard Gospel: Dealing Positively with Difference in the Church of Ireland'* was distributed to all the dioceses in the Church of Ireland. This nationwide process was described in the Church's Standing Committee Report of 2004 as being *'without precedent in the life of the Church of Ireland'*.

The Scoping Study provides a good baseline against which the Church of Ireland can measure progress on these issues in the future.

As a result of the findings and recommendations of the research it was decided that, whilst dealing with sectarianism would remain a major thrust of the project, the original initiative was too narrow and that a strategic vision for the future was required.

## 2.2  Hard Gospel Strategy

A strategy for the hard gospel project was developed with a vision statement and a set of strategic aims and objectives. The vision was for:

*'A Church of Ireland which takes a positive leadership role in addressing the issues of sectarianism and dealing with difference that face the rapidly changing societies across the island of Ireland in the 21st century and a membership who contribute constructively to the development of transformed communities through reflecting and outworking Christ's command to love God and their neighbour.'*

The project had four strategic aims with an associated set of objectives:

**1.** To enable the Church, at all levels, to model the relationships and values with regard to overcoming sectarianism, community conflict, and dealing with difference that it will promote in wider society.

Objectives:

• Examine and change central structures and representative bodies to achieve more balanced participation within the Church of Ireland.

• Enhance existing and, where needed, provide new structures of internal dialogue to promote openness and understanding of difference in the Church of Ireland.

• Identify and change areas where sectarianism and destructive patterns of relating to difference affect the witness and ministry of the Church of Ireland. This will involve dialogue with, among others, representatives of: Loyal Orders, ethnic minorities, women's groups, disability organisations and gender and sexuality groups.

2. To develop and promote policies, practices and statements of the Church of Ireland that will encourage honest and constructive relationships in dealing with sectarianism and issues of difference in the church and wider society.

Objectives:

- Proof all policies, practices and statements of the Church of Ireland in terms of sectarianism and dealing positively with difference, including those where the current attitude of the church reflects historical identification with one political and cultural community.

- Identify areas of policy and practice where new guidelines on honest and constructive relationships in dealing with difference are needed and develop them.

- Widen the range of churches, faith communities and other interest groups with which the Church of Ireland has regular and established relationships.

- Raise the profile and increase understanding of the Church of Ireland's approach to sectarianism and dealing positively with difference through a focused and sustained programme of publicity and information.

3. To enhance the capability of the Church of Ireland at all levels to take initiatives to build peace and to transform communities.

Objectives:

- Provide training, support and resourcing for central leadership.

- Provide training, support and resourcing for diocesan/parish leadership, both clerical and lay.

- Modify initial and continuing clerical and lay training processes to include significant emphasis on learning to overcome sectarianism to deal positively with difference and to encourage/enable others to do the same.

- Develop the Youth training programme to include a significant emphasis on learning to move beyond sectarianism and to deal positively with difference

- Collate information about best practice in moving beyond sectarianism and dealing positively with difference and actively promote it within the church and beyond.

4. To implement initiatives, projects or programmes in collaboration with other Churches, agencies and groups in a manner that will create more open and inclusive local communities.

Objectives:

- Develop projects in partnership with key agencies that address profound issues of social cohesion within our community

- Work with as wide a range of key stakeholders as practical in a number of local areas to develop projects and programmes which address identified need, and will be owned by all involved

- Develop a strong international dimension to the Hard Gospel Project. This will involve building relationships with key agencies in other spheres of conflict, with the purpose of meaningful exchange of learning

- Seek appropriate short to medium-term sponsorship and funding for the initiatives, with the aim of encouraging them to become self-sustaining in the long term.

## 2.3 Funding

Funding for the Project was secured from a range of sources:

- The International Fund for Ireland Community Bridges Programme
- The Department of Foreign Affairs (ROI)
- The Church of Ireland
- The Church of Ireland Priorities Fund
- The NI Community Relations Council

This funding enabled the Committee to employ a small staff team with an associated project budget, to take forward the process.

A Director and two Project Officers (one based in Belfast and one based in Dublin) were appointed to deliver the project strategy.

# 3  Project Activities

The Hard Gospel Project initiated, developed, supported and co-ordinated a wide range of activities over a three-year period involving a considerable number of people across the island of Ireland. More than 7,500[3] people participated directly in these activities between November 2005 and December 2008. It is estimated that:

- Project activities took place in all thirty-two counties in Ireland.

- All twelve dioceses participated in project activities.

- 1,990 people participated in 135 parishes in local activities.

- 50% of participants in Northern Ireland, and 80% of participants in the Republic were from the Church of Ireland.

- 70% of participants in Northern Ireland were from a unionist community and 30% were from a nationalist community.

- 30% of activities in Northern Ireland were cross community (involving both nationalists and unionists).

- 15% of participants in the Republic and 10% in Northern Ireland were from minority ethnic communities.

- 50% of activities in the Republic and 10% of activities in Northern Ireland were cross-cultural (different ethnic groups).

- In the Republic of Ireland 40% of participants were men and 60% were women. In Northern Ireland 60% were men and 40% women.

- 50% of participants in Northern Ireland and 25% in the Republic were under the age of 25.

- Between 5-10% of participants were clergy.

[3] Source: Project staff reports. Figures are estimates and may include the same person attending more than one activity. Where percentages for the whole island were not available, separate figures are given for Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. The project included a considerable level of cross-border participation.

- Between 90-95% of participants were lay people.

- More than 95% of participants had not previously engaged in the type of activities initiated by the Hard Gospel Project.

## 3.1  Organisational Change Activities at Central Level

The Diversity Audit and Hard Gospel Impact Framework were developed and published. They were presented to and received by Standing Committee of 70 people including all Bishops and mailed to all 600 members of General Synod. Standing Committee set up a Hard Gospel Implementation Group to take action on recommendations of the audit of central structures.

In addition:

- A Diversity Good Practice Guide was developed.

- Guidelines on the make-up of diocesan committees were drawn up.

- The Archbishop of Armagh's working group on Migration, through the Armagh Board of Social Responsibility, produced two leaflets for use in the Diocese (*Parish Guidelines* and *Diocesan Undertakings*) and also brought together a list of support contacts.

## 3.2  Training Activities

The project developed 10 new training initiatives and as a result:

- More than 370 people participated in parish level training

- 90 people participated in diocesan level training

- 30 clergy participated in facilitative leadership training

- 20 people participated in youth work training

- 60 Church of Ireland Theological Institute students participated in training

The project also developed material for a Hard Gospel Sunday Service and a Lenten Course.
*"Hard Gospel Sunday was a high profile initiative this year. A considerable amount of material was produced and sent out to all the parishes throughout the country."* (Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

*"After the challenges in trying to articulate the Hard Gospel in the South during the first year, the project has now caught on in the Republic of Ireland - it has more credibility. In just 18 months it has been impossible to get every parish active. However Hard Gospel Sunday and the Lenten Courses have provided the opportunity for every parish to get involved in some way...Hard Gospel Sunday was successful - a significant minority of parishes participated."* (Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

## 3.3  Discussion and Dialogue Activities

The project initiated discussion and dialogue events with seven groups and 170 participants participated in these activities. The dialogues were with the following groups:

• Orange Order leadership

• Royal Black Preceptory leadership

• Masonic leadership

• Changing Attitudes Ireland (an advocacy group for the place of gay and lesbian individuals in the church)

• GAA leadership (80% lay)

• Irish Travellers Movement Board Members

• Afghan Hunger Strikers

The project also facilitated debates at the Summer Madness youth event:

• A 2007 debate attended by 700 young people when Ian Paisley Junior, (DUP MLA Junior Minister) and Caitriona Ruane (Sinn Fein MLA Education Minister) debated the topic "Sharing the Future?" in front of young people from all over Ireland.

• A 2008 debate attended by 200 young people.

Networking and partnership relationships were developed with more than 150 new churches, groups and agencies.

## 3.4  Diocesan Activities

10 dioceses were supported to develop specific diocesan activities. This included:

- A Research Study in the Clogher Diocese: the report was launched at a Diocesan Synod attended by 200 people and 3000 copies were distributed among all parishes.

- Training for clergy of Down and Dromore and Connor Dioceses on issues within working-class loyalist communities.

- Community relations training for clergy from Clogher Diocese.

- Supporting the United Dioceses of Dublin and Glendalough Diocesan Committee for the International Community to organise migrant-friendly services and have a full time staff member.

- Supporting the Dioceses of Cork, Cloyne and Ross to organise a conference entitled *'Understanding our History: Protestants, the Civil War and War of Independence in County Cork'*.

- Organising a seminar entitled *'Life in the Commuter Belt?'* and working with Board of Social Inclusion to look at issues of childcare provision in the Dioceses of Meath and Kildare.

- Training of ten clergy from the Diocese of Derry & Raphoe on an accredited *'Facilitative Leadership'* course.

570 people participated in these diocesan activities.

## 3.5  Synod Activities

The project had an input at 3 General Synods and 10 Diocesan Synods involving a total of 2,250 people.

At General Synod there were:

- Presentations from Very Rev Patrick Rooke and three staff members in Armagh in 2006.

- Presentations from Rev Doug Baker, Very Rev Patrick Rooke, Rev Earl Storey and a video presentation of the work of the project in Kilkenny in 2007.

- A Motion on the 39 Articles was put forward in Galway in 2008.

## 3.6  Speaking Engagements, Seminars and Conferences

Hard Gospel staff and committee members undertook more than 100 speaking engagements throughout Ireland including Sunday morning worship, clergy retreats, ecumenical events, youth groups, Mother's Unions, education groups and major festivals/events. More than 12,500[4] people attended these events.

21 seminars were organised, involving 1,270 people. This included the *'Beyond the Box'* seminars on a range of issues addressing the legacy of the Troubles and a series of Diocesan Consultations on Immigration.

Three conferences were organised, involving 380 people:

- *'A Pilgrim People: Encouraging the Church of Ireland to contribute positively to issues of migration, integration and community cohesion'*

- *'Understanding our History: Protestants, the War of Independence and the Civil War in County Cork'*

- *'The Future, Friend Or Foe'* Conference on the Celtic Tiger

The *'Our Kind of People'* Exhibitions in Monkstown and Rathcoole were viewed by 800 people.

## 3.7  Press and Media Activities

The project attracted a notable level of press and media coverage including:

- More than 80 features, articles and reports in national newspapers, most commonly in the *Irish Times, Irish News, Newsletter and Belfast Telegraph*.

- More than 25 features, articles and reports in regional newspapers such as the *Donegal News* and *Newtownabbey Times*.

- More than 60 features, articles and reports in the *Church of Ireland Gazette*.

- More than 100 features, articles and reports in a range of other magazines and journals including diocesan magazines, social and religious magazines, websites and blogs.

...................................................................................................................................

[4] If the number of people attending these speaking engagements is added to the total estimated number of direct participants in the project, the total number of people involved over the three-year period is more than 20,000 people.

- 28 radio and television interviews and reports mainly on RTE and the BBC.

- More than 180,000 hits per annum (an average of approximately 13,500 per month) on the Hard Gospel website.

## 3.8  Publications

Fifteen publications were produced and distributed including:

- *'Life Beyond Boundaries - A Theology of the Hard Gospel'* (May 2006) was distributed to all clergy, all members of General Synod in 2006, funders and key local politicians.

- A *'Hard Gospel Sunday'* Pack (July 2007) was distributed to all clergy in July 2007.

- Hard Gospel *'Welcome Posters'* in a variety of languages were distributed to all churches in July 2007.

- Two Hard Gospel Bulletins were distributed to all churches; Winter 2006 and Summer 2007.

- The *'Faith in Difference'* pack of 10 postcards and discussion material on diversity was distributed for Lent 2008 to all clergy and youth workers.

- The *'Youth Resource Pack'* of postcards and discussion materials on diversity was distributed in 2008 to all clergy and youth workers.

- *'Living With Difference - A Reality Check'* (May 08), the *'Audit of Central Structures'* and the *'Hard Gospel Impact Framework'* were distributed to all members of Standing Committee and General Synod in 2008.

- *'Whatever You Say, Say Nothing'* Report and DVD for Clogher Diocese in September 2008 there were 3000 copies printed and disseminated' to all parishes in Clogher Diocese and the wider community.

- A *'Directory of Migrant-Led Churches and Chaplaincies'* was published in December 2008.

- *'Good Samaritan - Reflect and Act'* course material.

- *'Love your Neighbour'* (Training pack).

- *'All the Loves'*, the winning hymn in the Hard Gospel Hymn-writing Competition was transcribed, recorded and distributed.

- *'The Youth Work and Spirituality'* paper was produced and distributed in 2008.

# 4 Main Achievements of the Project

*"The Hard Gospel Project is unique as a whole denomination approach that is reflective, active and structural. The Church of Ireland is the first denomination to engage in this work at its core... They have understood that change needs to be systemic and mainstreamed."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

The main achievements of the project were as follows:

## 4.1 Commitment

The Church of Ireland demonstrated its commitment to the development and implementation of the Hard Gospel Project through the level of time and resources invested in ensuring it made a difference. The project was managed effectively through the Hard Gospel Committee and a high level of activity was stimulated and delivered by the small project staff team.

The project used a formative evaluation approach very successfully. Each annual evaluation included a review meeting with stakeholders, which discussed progress against the intended aims and objectives and the successes and challenges of the previous year. Each Annual Evaluation Report included a set of recommendations for the subsequent year that addressed areas of work requiring further attention and intervention. The Hard Gospel Committee and the project staff team demonstrated a high level of commitment to continuous learning and improvement by following through on these recommendations each year.

The Chair of the Hard Gospel Committee and the Director worked hard to ensure progress across all aspects of the project.

## 4.2 Awareness Raising

The project was ambitious in attempting to influence every parish and every member of a large island wide institution. However, a major achievement over the three years was to raise awareness of the project and the issues it was spotlighting at all levels of the Church of Ireland.

Issues such as sectarianism, the legacy of the conflict and the Church's relationships with migrant and loyalist communities were clearly put on the agenda of a range of church meetings and publications, in many cases for the first time.

We do not have evidence to say that every member of the Church of Ireland had his or her awareness raised through the project. In fact, it is not clear whether that would be possible. However, it is possible to say that every parish and diocese in Ireland, every reader of the *Church of Ireland Gazette*, every clergy person and every attendee at the General Synods over the past three years will have an awareness of the Hard Gospel 'brand' and the issues it has highlighted.

The project developed a series of high quality resources and disseminated these throughout the Church. This included a theology of the Hard Gospel, a series of reports on demonstration models of practice, research reports, the audit and proofing tools, materials for Lent and training manuals.

Although the impact of this heightened awareness is largely dependent on the subsequent priority given to these issues by church leaders, the level of awareness achieved by the Hard Gospel within the Church of Ireland was significant.

Similarly, the project did achieve a wider community profile through good media coverage of its activities, as a result of a well-implemented communications strategy. This was most successful when the project highlighted issues that were then taken up and developed into wider public discussions though the media. Examples of this include the relationship between the GAA and Protestants and the findings of the research in the Clogher Diocese. The project also developed a good profile at a political level with both the Irish government and the Northern Ireland Assembly.

For many external stakeholders the Hard Gospel Project is recognised as the most significant and substantial denominational church initiative on peacebuilding that has taken place in Ireland (North and South).

## 4.3  New Conversations

An important outcome of the increased awareness achieved by the project was 'new conversations' within the Church of Ireland and also in the wider community. Conversations stimulated by the project were new in terms of:

• The subject matter being discussed
• The level of priority being afforded to the conversation

- The location (both level and geographical) of the discussions
- The individuals participating in the conversations

## 4.4  Foundations for the Future

The project began strategic planning for the future during the second year of the project. The time and resources invested in this forward planning are another indication of the level of commitment by the Church of Ireland to seeing through this initiative.

A part of this process was to develop structures and mechanisms within the Church for continuing the Hard Gospel process after the end of the Hard Gospel Three Year Project. The plans developed for achieving this have a strong focus on mainstreaming the process at a central level, while at the same time identifying ways of supporting sustained interventions at diocesan and parish levels.

## 4.5  Partnerships

The project was successful in developing a series of new collaborations and partnerships with other churches, organisations and agencies on relevant issues and initiatives. These partnerships included a cross-sectoral, cross-community and cross-border dimension.

## 4.6  Demonstration Projects

The demonstration projects were major achievements for main reasons:

- They addressed key strategic issues in relation to the legacy of conflict and a changing more multi cultural Ireland. In fact the projects on immigration and loyalist communities were at the 'cutting edge' of contemporary diversity and inclusion issues in Ireland during the past three years.
- They engaged the Church of Ireland in these issues at a level and depth that previously had not been possible.
- They were well designed and delivered by the project staff team.
- They attracted the attention of wider society.
- They were written up and disseminated as models of good practice for the wider church and society.

# 5  The Challenges

## 5.1  Scale of the Task

A major challenge was the fact that the project had set itself ambitious objectives for the three years and these objectives were to be achieved across a large geographical area, mainly delivered by a small staff team of three workers.

One of the biggest challenges in this context has been to engage individuals, parishes and dioceses in different parts of the project. It was more difficult to recruit people to act as links or to participate as facilitators or in training than to persuade them to attend meetings, seminars and conferences. The process of supporting people to engage in activities they had not previously regarded as priorities for the Church or in attempting to overcome apathy and/or complacency, is necessarily time-consuming as it often requires a one to one approach. Even with this role being shared beyond the project staff team, it was a large-scale task that was always going to be a major challenge.

## 5.2  Pace of Organisational Change

The size, nature and culture of the Church of Ireland as an institution results in a slow pace of organisational change. For example, it has taken the full three years of the project for the beginnings of change in structures, policies and practices to become apparent. In spite of substantial time and resources being invested in research, discussion, committees and publications, the *Diversity Audit* and *Hard Gospel Impact Framework* have produced limited change to date. Their success can only be measured in terms of any change that actually takes place in the future.

Similarly it has taken three years to identify and set up relevant and specific training for the bishops. Organisational change processes cannot succeed without the full engagement of the most senior leaders of any organisation.

This slow pace of change has prompted some external stakeholders to question the impact of the project:

*"The project has gone quite wide, but how deep has it gone? Does it just skim along the top of the Church or has it made real change?"* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

## 5.3  Organisational Culture

Another challenge for the project was that it attempted to change aspects of the 'organisational culture' of the Church while at the same time being a part of that culture.

Organisational change involves *"...an intervention strategy that uses group processes to focus on the whole culture of an organisation in order to bring about planned change."* (Rowlandson, 1984)

However, if one of the blocks to organisational change within an institution is the 'committee culture', then running a project by that group process is unlikely to substantially change the culture. The long-term impact of the Hard Gospel Project will be reduced if the recommendations for the future are somehow 'lost in committee.'

Organisational culture change also involves:

*"...a long term programme of intervention into the organisation's social processes, using principles and practices of behavioural science, to create attitudinal and behavioural changes, leading to increased organisational effectiveness."* (Bowman & Asch, 1987)

So, for example, if the culture of an organisation is polite avoidance of conflict, then even a project with the explicit purpose of stimulating challenging and honest dialogue may undermine itself by a polite avoidance of conflict.

*"The project has named some of the challenges and affirmed the theological underpinning, but it has had limited impact in dev*
(Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

The more 'difficult conversations' on difference appeared to be a challenge to the norm in the Church.

*"The Church of Ireland doesn't do conflict. There is a possibility that the Hard Gospel could be passed through deferentially, without any real change in behaviour. What would change look like on the ground if local parishes were really addressing sectarianism?"* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

## 5.4  Different Expectations

Another challenge was the fact that there were different expectations of the project within the Church, and at times within the committee and the project staff team.

This was particularly evident during the first year when there was considerable debate and a degree of confusion on what constituted a 'Hard Gospel Issue'. Some expected the project to address only sectarianism and cross-community dialogue between unionists and nationalists on the island, while others expected the project to address the wider legacy of the conflict such as loyalist paramilitaries. Some expected the project to address sectarianism as one of a range of diversity issues while others, particularly in the South, perceived sectarianism to be a 'Northern issue' and had an expectation that the project should be addressing mainly multi-cultural issues. Meanwhile others expected the project to address any community/social issue not currently being addressed by the Church.

Inevitably, such a range of expectations could not be met fully and this resulted in a sense of disappointment in the project for some.

At times this lack of clarity also resulted in the project staff sensing that some of the issues they were pursuing were perceived as of personal interest rather than of strategic importance. This could result in staff feeling their work was undervalued.

## 5.5 Continuity and Embedding

A major challenge for any project of this kind is the danger of being reduced to mere project status for 'those who like that sort of thing.' When this happens, organisational change projects fail to have long-term impact. After a flurry of project activity the institution continues on as before, unaffected.

The challenge for the Hard Gospel Project was to both stimulate and support new activities to demonstrate approaches and build capacity while at the same time influence organisational culture, policies, practices and structures so that the Hard Gospel would become a mainstream and embedded long-term process within the Church.

*"The Hard Gospel should be systemic - part of the culture of the church. It needs to move from project status and being identified with people 'who like that sort of thing' to become part of the 'endocrine system' of the Church of Ireland."*
(Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

# 6  The Impact of the Project

The evaluation framework developed at the start of the project focussed on measuring desired outcomes for each of the strategic aims and objectives. The purpose of this was to try to measure the impact of the project over the three-year period. This section of the report summarises the level of progress evident under each strategic aim.

## 6.1  To enable the Church, at all levels, to model the relationships and values with regard to overcoming sectarianism, community conflict, and dealing with difference that it will promote in wider society

The project provided a range of opportunities at all levels to address issues of difference, community conflict and sectarianism. This enabled the Church to take a series of new initiatives and some of these had an impact in the wider community.

There was substantial progress in examining central structures and representative bodies, through the development, implementation and publication of a Diversity Audit (*'Living with Difference: A Reality Check'*), that assessed the balance of composition of representative bodies.

The report was presented to Most Rev Alan Harper and the Standing Committee by January 2008. As a result an Implementation Group was set up by Standing Committee to plan a response and this work is continuing today.

The reports were also presented at the 2008 General Synod and copies were sent to all 600 members of the Synod.

The project was instrumental in developing greater linkages between church committees and some restructuring.

While this is clear evidence of significant progress, the level of change, which results from this audit in the future, will be the measure of its success. Without actual change the audit will have been a mere paper exercise. It will therefore be important to monitor change regarding imbalances in participation within central structures and representative bodies.

External stakeholders have been very positive in their comments regarding the Church of Ireland's commitment to self-examination:

*"The Hard Gospel sets up a challenge for all the churches and all sides of the community - they are prepared to look at themselves first and make change. This is a very strong and powerful message - true reconciliation involves looking at yourself."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

Throughout the three years of the project existing structures, such as General Synod, Diocesan Synods and the *Church of Ireland Gazette*, were used for internal dialogue to promote understanding and difference in the Church of Ireland. Project staff and several committee members promoted discussion on issues of difference through a broad range of meetings, speaking engagements, conferences and seminars within the church. New structures of internal dialogue were also developed such as the 'Hot Potato' page on the Hard Gospel website to address contentious issues in church and community life. Other examples were the introduction of a Hard Gospel Sunday and a series of parish based 'Beyond the Box' seminars to stimulate internal dialogue.

Discussion of 'Hard Gospel issues' has become normative within the Church of Ireland. The issues and approaches of the Hard Gospel are becoming mainstreamed into the Church and there has been a degree of culture change towards more open discussion of diversity issues.

*"There seems to be a greater sense of 'permission' to talk about these issues. There is a change of atmosphere where it has become more of the norm to discuss Hard Gospel issues throughout the Church."* (Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

The project also engaged Church of Ireland representatives in new and challenging dialogue with organisations, including some for the first time. There was a series of dialogue meetings with leaders from Loyal Orders (Orange Order and the Royal Black Preceptory), the Masonic Order, ethnic minorities (including asylum seekers and Travellers groups), the GAA and an advocacy group for the place of gay and lesbian individuals in the church (Changing Attitudes Ireland). The dialogue process that has begun with the Orange Order has been a particularly substantive one in terms of the range of Church of Ireland representatives involved and the issues discussed.

On a number of occasions the church was recognised as a catalyst and, to some extent, a model for addressing key issues of social cohesion. The project produced a notable level of external media (press, television and radio) in both the North and the South, where the church's role in relation to social cohesion was highlighted. The project also

successfully stimulated debate in the media on key issues of social cohesion. Issues that were raised through the project, which attracted attention in wider society, included:

- Migration issues
- Experiences of Protestants living on the border
- A process for removing 'Peace Walls'
- Sectarianism in the Republic of Ireland
- Community development and leadership in loyalist communities
- Peace and reconciliation
- Dealing with the past

## 6.2 To develop and promote policies, practices and statements of the Church of Ireland that will encourage honest and constructive relationships in dealing with sectarianism and issues of difference in the church and wider society

The project began to promote an approach to policy, practices and statements that will involve a 'proofing' process in relation to sectarianism and dealing positively with difference, including areas where the current attitude of the Church of Ireland reflects historical identification with one political and cultural community.

A tool for proofing all policies, practices and statements, *The Hard Gospel Impact Framework* was developed and published (*Living with Difference: A Reality Check*). The Impact Framework recommended that all areas of policy and practice be proofed for honest and constructive relationships in dealing with difference. It provides a series of questions, based on five key principles, against which decisions, statements, policies, strategies and programmes can be proofed.

The principles are:

- Generous inclusion
- Intentional communication

- Lucid language
- Rooted relationships
- Creating community

The Impact Framework recommends that it should be used at parish, diocesan and central levels.

It also recommends that training should be made available to both clergy and laity in the use of the Framework.

*"We need to introduce prejudice awareness training to make us more open and tolerant people in our character...that would help ensure these principles are part of the culture and influencing all of our decisions."* (Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

The Impact Framework was presented to Most Rev Alan Harper and the Standing Committee in January 2008, alongside the Diversity Audit. The Implementation Group set up by Standing Committee was also tasked with planning a response to the recommendations within the Impact Framework and this work continues. The Impact Framework was also presented at the 2008 General Synod and copies were sent to all 600 members of the Synod.

There was strong commitment to mainstreaming the Hard Gospel by the new Archbishop of Armagh, who wrote:

*"...everything in the Church of Ireland from now on should be 'Hard Gospel Proofed'. That is we should encourage a culture of conducting a 'Hard Gospel/Equality Impact Assessment' on all the work that we do and especially anything that receives central church support. That might or might not include inviting people who are not members of the Church of Ireland independently to scrutinize what we do and the way we do things."*

The level of change, which results from this proofing tool in the future, will be a measure of its success. Unless there are identifiable changes in policies, practices and statements, the Hard Gospel Impact Framework will only have created the appearance of a change process. It will therefore be essential to track change in policies and practices where sectarianism and destructive patterns of relating to difference have in the past had a negative impact on the witness and ministry of the Church of Ireland.

As well as the development of the Impact Framework the project stimulated an increase in the number of public discussions at leadership level on issues of sectarianism, difference and dealing with the legacy of the conflict.

There was a notable increase in the number of conferences and forums where these issues are addressed directly. This included General Synod, Diocesan Synods and the Church of Ireland Theological Institute.

*"The Hard Gospel has become high profile through specific events, projects and initiatives - things are seen to be happening."*
(Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

However, in contrast, some stakeholders believed that the project did not have an impact in many local parishes.

*"The Hard Gospel has a visibility deficit. Many local churches haven't heard of it. It hasn't impacted on their diocese or parish."*
(Internal Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

In addition to the internal impacts, the project also had considerable success in raising the profile and increasing understanding of the Church of Ireland approach to sectarianism and dealing positively with difference. The project had regular contact and relationships with a wide range of other churches, faith communities and interest groups such as local authorities, various government departments and the new African churches in the South.

A focussed, effective and sustained communications strategy targeting both internal and external stakeholders was successfully implemented. Press releases/statements on topical issues such as immigration, peace and reconciliation and loyalism were issued regularly and these achieved good media coverage and a sustained profile throughout the lifetime of the project. This media coverage created new conversations both within the Church and also within wider society. A good example was the high level of media coverage, during September 2008, for the publication of the Hard Gospel research study 'Whatever You Say, Say Nothing' on the experience of border Protestants in the Clogher Diocese. The publication of the research findings stimulated a significant number of discussions at church, community, media and political levels. The impact of these discussions is likely to extend well beyond the lifetime of the project.

## 6.3  To enhance the capability of the Church of Ireland at all levels to take initiatives to build peace and to transform communities

The project enhanced the overall capability of the Church of Ireland to take initiatives to build peace and transform communities by providing training and support at parish and diocesan levels and by supporting the development of a series of diocesan and parish level initiatives. The outcome is new initiatives by churches actively contributing to

community development and peacebuilding, including youth initiatives, in a breadth of locations and levels.

Another impact is an increased level of communications, literature, speeches, sermons and meetings with a focus on the Hard Gospel and its issues.

The project developed, piloted, delivered, evaluated and revised a training course for use at parish leadership level. The course was delivered in parishes across Ireland and was published as a *Facilitators Handbook* entitled *'The Good Samaritan Course: Reflect and Act'* and all Church of Ireland clergy received a copy of this. In 2008 the project engaged an experienced facilitator to train local facilitators in the use of these materials. However, to date, it has been difficult to recruit facilitators for this training in local parishes. The long-term success of the course will be dependent on how well this resource is used in local parishes in the future.

The project has been effective in building the church's capacity to address sectarianism, immigration and Loyalist community issues through successful, Hard Gospel staff-led, demonstration projects. At diocesan level, a series of significant demonstration initiatives on key strategic diversity issues were developed, implemented and recorded. Each of these projects has been written up and it is intended that this learning will be disseminated in 2009. These initiatives had considerable impact both within and outside of the church.

The demonstration projects were:

- The Church of Ireland and the loyalist community: this included a range of parish-based activities, seminars, meetings and dialogues

- The Church of Ireland and immigration: this included a major conference, inter cultural training, engagement with a wide range of groups and activities and involvement in the development of a directory of migrant-led churches.

- *'Whatever You Say - Say Nothing'* - a research study into the experience and views of border Protestants in the Clogher Diocese.

- 'Understanding our History' in the Diocese of Cork, Cloyne & Ross: this project provided a space for discussion of the Civil War in Ireland and the impact on relations between Protestants and Catholics in the diocese today.

In addition to these demonstration projects the project highlighted other stories and case studies to share good practice within the church and beyond.

The project worked with the Church of Ireland Youth Department to develop *'Where would Jesus be?'*- a youth work resource pack addressing issues facing young people concerning racism, sectarianism and the ever-changing nature of a multi-ethnic Ireland. The resource was designed to enhance the capacity of youth groups in their exploration and understanding of reconciliation issues.

Among the participants in all of these activities there was an increase in understanding and confidence to increase engagement in 'difference issues'. The project also increased capacity and activity amongst churches that were already involved in community development and peacebuilding.

The project staff provided one-to-one support to clergy to consider how to engage with Loyalist communities in the North and how to engage with immigration issues in the South.

The project staff supported and initiated a number of new initiatives at local level such as the successful:

• *'Our Kind of People'* education exhibitions

• Parish-based *'Beyond the Box'* seminars

• *'Creating Space Programme'* between Rathcoole Parish and Clonard Monastery

• Craigavon Churches Together project on migrant workers

The project also supported the development of the Armagh Diocese Guidelines on Immigration in partnership with the Armagh Working Group on Migration.

However the pace of development of new local initiatives was slow and it appeared to be very difficult for local parishes to move from discussion and reflection into practical action, without substantial direct involvement from Hard Gospel staff. This remains a major challenge for the future.

An initiative aimed at a selection of those in leadership (bishops, church members and clergy) in the Church of Ireland in the Republic called *'The Future - Friend or Foe?'* was supported to enable participants to reflect on the changes that have taken place in the Republic of Ireland over the past ten years, and to assess how effectively the Church of Ireland has responded or reacted to this change.

The central leadership of the Church did not engage in any specific training during the three years of the project. This is a clear gap in terms of enhancing the capacity of the institution. Organisational change processes do not

succeed without central leadership commitment, training and learning. The project found it difficult to identify relevant training for Bishops. However, the recommendation from the Year 2 Evaluation in December 2007, to invite an expert in organisational culture change to provide training for central leadership, took place in February 2009.

Clergy training was delivered by the project on issues such as asylum seekers, ministry to loyalist communities and facilitative leadership.

The project also attempted to influence the Church of Ireland Theological Institute, which was engaged in a major review during the lifetime of the project. This was an excellent opportunity for the Hard Gospel to influence future clerical and lay training and several meetings took place to discuss this.

The Hard Gospel Project intended to modify initial and continuing clerical and lay training processes to include significant emphasis on learning to overcome sectarianism to deal positively with difference and to encourage/enable others to do the same. It is believed that future training will include some themes that relate to these priorities such as leadership skills, reconciliation and building relationships.

## 6.4　To implement initiatives, projects or programmes in collaboration with other Churches, agencies and groups in a manner that will create more open and inclusive local communities

The project staff successfully implemented a series of initiatives with other churches, agencies and groups with a clear focus on creating more open and inclusive local communities.

This included:

- *'Beyond the Box'* seminars in partnership with 'The Junction' (a community relations resource centre in Derry/Londonderry) and in partnership with Protestant and Catholic parishes in Lurgan.

- Facilitating discussions on the impact of faith-based youth work training on community relations.

- A range of partnerships with migrant-led churches in the South with the project officer acting as a bridge person for African churches to be represented at the Taoiseach's Government/Faith Groups Dialogue meeting leading a meeting between Anglican and Catholic parishes in Clondalkin and the residents of a newly opened hostel and

community representatives, attended by the Minister for Integration, Conor Lenihan TD and involvement in the publication of a directory of 361 migrant-led churches in Ireland.

- Working with Churches Together in Craigavon on migrant worker issues.
- Engaging a range of churches, schools, statutory, voluntary and community organisations in local partnerships around the *'Our Kind of People'* projects in Monkstown and Rathcoole.

The project was successful in securing additional funding for many of the initiatives that were developed.

However, these initiatives tended to be organised by the project staff. Parishes find it difficult to move from discussion, reflection and training into the development of local practical community projects. An indication of the Hard Gospel having become genuinely mainstreamed will be the continued development of projects of this nature in the future.

*"Every Diocese needs to have a Hard Gospel Project based on the local context. The Diocese should support projects to get started at local parish level."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

Other examples of a new type of relationship developed through the project included:

- Involvement in the All-Ireland Churches Consultative Meeting on Racism (AICCMR)
- The Director attended Sinn Fein's launch of its *Charter for Unionist Engagement*
- Local Community Gardai were invited to *'Reflect and Act'* in Navan and Clondalkin - a first for both parishes

External stakeholders involved in these partnerships were positive in their comments about partnership with the Hard Gospel project:

*"The Hard Gospel has been an extremely useful partner. They represent a constituency of church people that we have found it difficult to access in terms of engaging in cross community dialogue."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

*"The Hard Gospel has a voice that can be listened to - not on its own but with other organisations. They can join with others to see that asylum seekers get fair treatment."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

*"The Hard Gospel tried to see how the community can accept us as asylum seekers. There was violence and abusive words towards us, but after the Hard Gospel dialogue since then we have not had any negative issues in the community."* (External Stakeholder Interview, Year 2)

However some internal stakeholders believed that progress in this area was limited, particularly in terms of substantial collaborative co-working and co-sponsoring with other churches and agencies.

Although the project did not develop as strong an international dimension as originally intended, it did develop several opportunities to build relationships with key agencies in other spheres of conflict, with the purpose of meaningful exchange of learning. The main activity was the development of relationships with Burundi including hosting a visit of the President in 2008. This included a series of meetings with political and church leaders and academics.

# 7  Conclusions

1.  The Hard Gospel Project initiated, developed, supported and co-ordinated a wide range of activities involving more than 7,500 people across every diocese in Ireland between November 2005 and December 2008. This is the most substantial denominational church initiative of its kind to have taken place in Ireland.

2.  The Church of Ireland demonstrated its commitment to the development and implementation of the Hard Gospel Project through the level of time and resources invested in ensuring it made a difference. The project was managed effectively through the Hard Gospel Committee and a high level of activity was stimulated and delivered by the small project staff team.

3.  A major achievement was to raise awareness of the project and the issues it was spotlighting at all levels of the Church of Ireland. The project provided a range of opportunities at all levels to address issues of difference, community conflict and sectarianism. Discussion of 'Hard Gospel issues' has become normative within the Church of Ireland. The issues and approaches of the Hard Gospel are becoming mainstreamed into the Church and there has been a degree of culture change towards more open discussion of diversity issues. This enabled the Church to take a series of new initiatives and some of these had an impact in the wider community.

4.  The project enhanced the overall capability of the Church of Ireland to take initiatives to build peace and transform communities by providing training and support at parish and diocesan levels and by supporting the development of a series of diocesan and parish level initiatives. The outcome is new initiatives by churches actively contributing to community development and peacebuilding, including youth initiatives, in a breadth of locations and levels.

5.  The project developed a series of high quality resources and disseminated these throughout the Church and beyond.

6.  The project developed demonstration projects that addressed key strategic issues in relation to the legacy of conflict and an increasingly multi cultural Ireland. The projects on immigration and Loyalist communities were at the 'cutting edge' of contemporary diversity and inclusion issues in Ireland during the past three years.

They engaged the Church of Ireland in these issues at a level and depth that had previously not been possible. The projects were well designed and delivered by the project staff team and they attracted the attention of wider society. They have been written up and disseminated as models of good practice for the wider church and society.

7. The pace of organisational change as a result of the project has been slow. It has taken three years for the beginnings of change in structures, policies and practices to become apparent. In spite of substantial time and resources being invested in research, discussion, committees and publications, this has produced limited change to date. Success can only be measured in terms of any change that actually takes place in the future.

8. The project faced challenges including the scale of the task, different expectations, barriers to change within the 'culture' of the Church and the danger of being reduced to the status of a marginal short-term project.

9. A major challenge was to both stimulate and support activities to demonstrate new approaches and build capacity while at the same time influence organisational culture, policies, practices and structures so that the Hard Gospel would become a mainstream and embedded long-term process within the Church.

10. The project achieved a wider community profile through good media coverage of its activities, as a result of a well-implemented communications strategy. This was most successful when the project highlighted issues that were then taken up and developed into wider public discussions though the media.

11. The project was successful in developing a series of new collaborations and partnerships with other churches, organisations and agencies on relevant issues and initiatives. The project staff successfully implemented a series of initiatives with other churches, agencies and groups with a clear focus on creating more open and inclusive local communities.

12. The plans developed for the post project phase of the Hard Gospel process have a strong focus on mainstreaming the process at a central level, while at the same time identifying ways of supporting sustained interventions at diocesan and parish levels.

# 8 Recommendations for the Future

*"...FAILURE would be for the Hard Gospel Project Team to do some really challenging and interesting things in various settings, and build some important relationships with groups beyond whom the Church of Ireland normally relates to well, but <u>not</u> find ways of bringing the wider church into that process, or involving a wide range of church members engaging in those new and deeper relationships with others, or imparting skills to a host of members who will continue Hard Gospel kind of actions long beyond the staff team's employment...*

*SUCCESS on the other-hand, would involve:*
*An integration of the themes and priorities of the Hard Gospel into the ongoing work of every board, committee, and agency of central church structures, and of every group in each parish - so that whenever the Hard Gospel staff, committee and name fade from memory in the Church of Ireland its essence remains...*

*Can the Church of Ireland do it? Absolutely. There is high level support from key leadership and there is plenty of easily identifiable action for every person here to get on with now..."*
(Extract from Rev Doug Baker's Address to General Synod, 2007)

The evaluation has one major recommendation that the Church of Ireland should put in place the necessary structures, strategies and resources to continue its Hard Gospel process as a long-term mainstream initiative within the Church that will create both internal change and practical action in local communities on diversity issues.

# Appendices

## Appendix 1  Evaluation Framework

### Aim 1:

To enable the Church, at all levels, to model in its own structures and ways of being, the relationships and values with regard to overcoming sectarianism, community conflict, and dealing with difference that it will promote in wider society:

| Outcome | Measures/Indicators | Data Collection |
|---|---|---|
| 1. The Church is recognised as a catalyst and a model for addressing key issues of social cohesion.<br>2. The Church makes a difference to society in dealing with these issues.<br>3. The Church at all levels engages in new dialogue with organisations that it traditionally has little or no engagement with.<br>4. The Church engages in a prayerful self-examination of its own values in relation to these issues. | 1. Number of external references to the church as a model and a catalyst.<br>2. Number of forums and public events.<br>3. A number of examples of activities which involve self examination.<br>4. Evidence of action taken as a result of self examination. | 1. Five year progress review (2003-2008) *(external additional resources required)*<br>2. Cuttings/media library where HG is referenced. *(Director)*<br>3. List of forums and public events. *(Administrator)*<br>4. Monthly and Quarterly reports.<br>5. Leaders and parish survey.<br>6. Case studies. *(External Facilitator and Project Officers)*<br>7. Focus groups. *(External Facilitator)*<br>8. External and internal stakeholder interviews. *(External Facilitator)* |

## Appendix 1  Evaluation Framework

### Aim 2:

To develop and promote policies, practices and statements of the Church of Ireland, that will encourage honest and constructive relationships in dealing with sectarianism and issues of difference in the church and wider society.

| Outcome | Measures/Indicators | Data Collection |
|---|---|---|
| 1. There are explicit discussions on sectarianism and difference within the Church of Ireland at all levels.<br>2. There is a benchmark policy on diversity and equality issues.<br>3. There is an ongoing audit of central and diocesan structures and a redress of identified imbalances.<br>4. There is open and public discussion on relevant issues. | 1. Increase in number conferences and forums where these issues are addressed directly.<br>2. A benchmark policy is published and implemented.<br>3. An annual audit is mainstreamed into structures.<br>4. There is improved balance within structures.<br>5. Increase in number of public discussions. | 1. Five year progress review (2003-2008) *(External additional resources required)*<br>2. Compile a list of partnerships conferences and forums. *(Administrator)*<br>3. Monthly and Quarterly reports.<br>4. Internal stakeholder interviews. *(External Facilitator)*<br>5. Cuttings/media library where HG is referenced. *(Director)*<br>6. Published audits and committee minutes. *(Administrator)* |

## Appendix 1  Evaluation Framework

## Aim 3:

To enhance the capability of the Church of Ireland at all levels to take initiatives to build peace and to transform communities:

| Outcome | Measures/Indicators | Data Collection |
|---|---|---|
| 1. The dominant culture in the Church of Ireland is recognised to be 'loving God and loving your neighbour'. <br> 2. There is an increased understanding and theological coherence of 'difference' issues which has led to new vision, relevance, confidence and skills among leaders at all levels. <br> 3. There are new initiatives of churches actively contributing to community development and peacebuilding, including youth initiatives, in a breadth of locations and levels. <br> 4. There is increased capacity and activity amongst churches already involved in community development and peacebuilding. | 1. Increased level of internal communications, literature, speeches, sermons and meetings with a focus on the Hard Gospel and its issues. <br> 2. Increased level of external recognition by other churches, civic organisations and various media agencies with a focus on the Hard Gospel and its issues. <br> 3. An increase in understanding and confidence of leaders leading to an increase in engagement in 'difference' issues. <br> 4. The number of new corporate initiatives at local, diocesan and central levels. <br> 5. The number of existing initiatives that have been supported/enabled further by the Hard Gospel Project to grow and develop. <br> 6. Examples of individuals who have changed and taken initiatives that they might not otherwise have thought of. | 1. Five year progress review (2003-2008) <br> 2. Cuttings/media library where Hard Gospel is referenced. *(Director)* <br> 3. Database of speaking engagements. *(Administrator)* <br> 4. Collection of stories of good practice. *(Project Officers)* <br> 5. Leaders and parish survey. <br> 6. Database of Hard Gospel participants. *(Project Officers & Administrator)* <br> 7. Case studies. *(External Facilitator and Project Officers)* <br> 8. Focus groups. *(External Facilitator)* |

## Appendix 1  Evaluation Framework

### Aim 4:

To implement initiatives, projects or programmes in collaboration with other Churches, agencies and groups in a manner that will create more open and inclusive local communities:

| Outcome | Measures/Indicators | Data Collection |
|---|---|---|
| 1. There are new relationships and working partnerships between the Church of Ireland and other Churches, agencies and groups.<br>2. There are developed relationships and working partnerships between the Church of Ireland and other Churches, agencies and groups.<br>3. There is a range of new local community projects being implemented.<br>4. The Church is a catalyst for the creation of more stable and vibrant local communities.<br>5. Learning and encouragement from successful projects is shared within the Church and further a field. | 1. An increased number of relationships and partnerships.<br>2. An increased level of activity between existing relationships and partnerships.<br>3. An increased number of local community projects.<br>4. A number of external references to the Church's role initiating community projects.<br>5. An increase in confidence of the local church engaging in the local community.<br>6. An increase in the level of strategic communications internally and externally.<br>7. Evidence of action taken from shared learning. | 1. Five year progress review (2003-2008) *(External additional resources required)*<br>2. Compile a list of partnerships made. *(Administrator)*<br>3. Monthly and Quarterly reports.<br>4. Leaders and parish survey. *(External Facilitator and Project Officers)*<br>5. Case studies. *(External Facilitator and Project Officers)*<br>6. Focus groups. *(External Facilitator)*<br>7. External and internal stakeholder interviews. *(External Facilitator)*<br>8. Cuttings/media library where Hard Gospel is referenced. *(Director)*<br>9. Reports of the implementation of the communication strategy. *(Communications sub-committee)* |

## Appendix 2  Hard Gospel Publications 2006-09

All resources are available for download from **www.hardgospel.net**

*Life Beyond Boundaries:* A Theology and Introduction to the Hard Gospel Project

*Hard Gospel Bulletins:* Regular news updates on Hard Gospel events and initiatives

*Child Poverty Leaflet:* Information on child poverty statistics and resources

*Hard Gospel: Loving our Neighbours:* A Lenten study course for parishes

*Hard Gospel Sunday 2007:* A resource pack including materials for Sunday worship and schools

*Hard Gospel Welcome Poster:* Designed for use in church entrances, it features the word 'Welcome'
in languages represented in Ireland today

*Reflect and Act Good Samaritan course:* An Advent study course for parishes

*Living With Difference: A Reality Check:* A Diversity Audit Report and Hard Gospel Impact Framework
produced by Tommy Stewart and Karen Jardine

*Faith and Difference:* A series of photographs and scenarios for parish study groups

*Hard Gospel Hymn-Writing Competition:* A transcript and CD recording of the winning hymn 'All the Loves'

*Peace: A Work in Progress: Issues of Ongoing Concern in Northern Ireland:* Published by The Junction in Derry/Londonderry,
it consists of transcripts from 'Beyond the Box' seminars organised in collaboration with the Hard Gospel Project

*Where Would Jesus Be?* A youth resource pack published with Church of Ireland Youth Department designed
to support Church groups in their exploration of living and dealing with difference

*Whatever You Say, Say Nothing*; Clogher Border Protestant Report: A report on the views and experiences
of Border Protestants for the Church of Ireland Diocese of Clogher, written by David Gardiner

*Armagh Leaflets on Migration:* Parish Guidelines on welcoming immigrants to local parishes

*Directory of Migrant-Led Churches and Chaplaincies (2009):* Supported by the Hard Gospel and published by the
All-Ireland Churches Consultative Meeting on Racism, the directory gives the details of 361 migrant-led
churches and chaplaincies throughout the island

*The Youth Work and Spirituality:* paper was produced and distributed in 2008

## Appendix 3   Staff Team

Director: Rev Earl Storey *(www.topstorey.org)*
Project Officer *(Belfast based)*: Stephen Dallas
Project Officer *(Dublin based)*: Philip McKinley